

**BRAD LITTLE**  
GOVERNOR

**Wendi Secrist**  
Executive Director



**Deni Hoehne**  
Chair

**John Young**  
Vice Chair

## WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL

514 W Jefferson St, Ste 131, Boise, ID 83702

### Workforce Development Policy Committee Meeting Minutes – July 30, 2024

**Committee Members:** Hope Morrow, Lori Barber, Christi Gilchrist, Jason Hudson, ~~Tom Kealey~~, ~~Clay Long~~, Heather Luchte (proxy for Clay Long) Daniel Puga, Jani Revier, ~~Tom Schultz~~, John Smith, ~~Scott Bedke~~

**Staff:** Sherawn Reberry, Kimberly Gardner, Denise Hill, Wendi Secrist, Sherise Porchia

**Guests:** Cathleen McHugh, IDOE; Craig Shaw, IDOL; Sara Studdard, IDOE; Kate Collins, OSBE; Sara Brown, Idaho Lobbyist; Kevin Richert, Idaho Ed News; Stuart Anderson, Burning Glass Institute, Shrinidhi Rao, Burning Glass Institute

**Call to Order at 9:02 a.m.**

#### Welcome

Hope Morrow, Chair

- **Roll Call**
- **Review Agenda**
- **Introductions**
- **\*Review May 29, 2024 Meeting Minutes**

**Motion by Ms. Revier to approve the May 29, 2024 Meeting Minutes as written. Second by Ms. Barber. Motion carried.**

#### Adult and Student LAUNCH Updates (9:15 – 10:00)

Hope Morrow, Chair

- Helping Students with Their Future
- Quarterly Report Questions (Adult)
  - Adults by region – graph
  - Will continue to visualize for future
  - Comparing salaries will be part of standard quarterly reporting
- Student LAUNCH Final Awards
  - Data points were discussed
  - Communication to participants
- Idaho LAUNCH Grant Management System
  - Timeline for students
    - Receive offer, 2 weeks to accept or decline
      - Must upload appropriate documentation
      - Task resubmit requests provide additional 2 week window to respond
  - System Checks and Balances

**BRAD LITTLE**  
GOVERNOR

**Wendi Secrist**  
*Executive Director*



**Deni Hoehne**  
*Chair*

**John Young**  
*Vice Chair*

## WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL

514 W Jefferson St, Ste 131, Boise, ID 83702

- What they need to do...
  - Students
    - Receive Email
    - Login
      - Accept Button (or decline)
    - Complete Tasks
      - Demographics
      - Uploads for Eligibility:
        - Diploma / Transcript
        - Career Pathway Plan
        - Identity Verification
        - Residence Verification
      - Institution Verification
      - Program Verification
      - Course Cost Allocation
    - Submit
  - WDC
    - For Participants
      - Send Invites
      - Acceptance Processes
        - Review Document Uploads
          - Graduation
          - Career Pathway Plan
          - Identification
          - Residency
        - Review Extensions
        - Review Resubmittals
      - Password Resets
      - Answer Questions
    - For Providers
      - Ensure Approved (Proprietary Schools & ETP)
      - Approve Programs
      - Approve Costs
      - Approve Updates/Changes
      - Answer Questions
  - Providers
    - Answer Questions
    - Update:

**BRAD LITTLE**  
GOVERNOR

**Wendi Secrist**  
*Executive Director*



**Deni Hoehne**  
*Chair*

**John Young**  
*Vice Chair*

## **WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL**

514 W Jefferson St, Ste 131, Boise, ID 83702

- Review Students
- Invoice
- Manually reviewing graduation data as the state generated system is not updated in time to auto verify graduation
- Home school data point important for state board
  - seeing various diplomas signed by parents
- Identity – automatic connection with DMV for verification if driver’s license used
- Providers 82 currently, with some new interest
- Discussion Points:
  - What are the staff investment hours for each student
    - 1<sup>st</sup> year daunting, next year should be less
    - Huge investment in communication
    - WDC – full staff, very labor intensive, learning this year for next
    - Looking at how we can have the system review the diplomas and transcripts, vendor has capability,
      - We are looking at how this year’s experiences may be beneficial in the future
    - Counselors did a great job talking to the kids – went into classes, they can see who has applied and have special days for assistance
    - Some counselors are working with students during the summer
    - Looking at process improvements – thinking through ways to make the final awards before school gets out
      - Discussion with institutions – would need touch points during summer
      - What can we do if we do part of the final awards before the end of summer
    - Providing a lot of grace, trying our best to assist in every way
    - Spot check on compliance?
      - For every participant the institution verifies good standing, program, they validate and add invoice amount. The system checks everything including cost. Payment will not be released unless everything is accurate.
      - Institution gives us a heads up with any changes or issues
      - Institutions must show transcripts
      - Some are not accredited, but the rule is written such that non-accredited may need to address long-term
      - DOE is being directed by DAG in one off situations

**BRAD LITTLE**  
GOVERNOR

**Wendi Secrist**  
Executive Director



**Deni Hoehne**  
Chair

**John Young**  
Vice Chair

## **WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL**

514 W Jefferson St, Ste 131, Boise, ID 83702

### **Burning Glass Institute Project Overview (10:00 – 12:00)**

**Kimberly Gardner**

- Project Overview by Stuart Anderson of the Burning Glass Institute
  - Phase 0
    - Meet to discuss and align metrics
    - Understand Idaho economic and labor contexts and WDC current approach
  - Phase 1
    - BGI collects, cleans, and processes data from Idaho learner outcomes
  - Phase 2
    - Program evaluation

### • In-Demand Matrix Overview

**Sherawn Reberry**

- Where is the data being derived
  - Tracking outcomes by income band allowed us to understand which programs that most boosted economic mobility and what value credentials play in that mobility
  - Measuring the value of credentials
    - Employment: do credentials drive greater employability and higher employment rates among learners
    - Aligned employment: to what extent do learners without earned credentials find employment in fields aligned to the credential
    - Wages: how do the earnings of earners change after earning credentials
    - Return to investment: how do the earnings premiums associated with a given credential compare to the cost of earning the credential
    - Continued mobility, align to local demand, alignment to growth, skill development, employer currency
    - Credential Evaluation
      - Evaluation is built on BGIs proprietary career history profiles
      - Credentials are standardized with three identifiers
      - Counterfactual analysis allows us to account for characteristics
    - Hold Credentials to the same outcomes and standards
- In-demand Career Matrix Discussion
  - Discussion from above
    - Why it is important to have a foundation of data?
      - Don't over-index
      - Create a balance
      - Constantly looking a couple different views
    - What you are using for counterfactual
      - Occupation observed
      - Consumer financial protection bureau, used name-based matching
      - Built predictive model

**BRAD LITTLE**  
GOVERNOR

**Wendi Secrist**  
*Executive Director*



**Deni Hoehne**  
*Chair*

**John Young**  
*Vice Chair*

## **WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL**

514 W Jefferson St, Ste 131, Boise, ID 83702

- Finding credentials that are not listed in traditional sources
  - Untraditional hiring through non-public models
  - Building skills profiles
  - Need under-estimated because models don't reflect how these employers find employees
- Micro-credentials – would like to include them
- Tried to capture all that may be possible – micro, badge, license,
- Building ways to look at non-wage data
- In-Demand Matrix Discussion Continued
  - Facilitated Discussion on the data elements to include
    - Metrics excel – what we have – for whole state
      - Living wage come from MIT
        - Looked at SOC & median wage
      - If occupation is at living wage or above (no data)
      - Some data sets can only provide a projection
      - Churn rates help define demand levels
      - Need to communicate the reality of actual job availability in the state
      - Mobility is a factor
      - Last year for the development of the in-demand careers as a reminder, we utilized the number of openings (we looked at projected growth rate, but determined to use the number of openings)
      - This year blend 4-5 metrics to define the In demand careers
    - Projected annual openings
      - DOL– from long term projection, 10-year change and add those that have growth in that position
      - Growth is historical data and taking into this account
      - 10 year projection model can be conservative
      - Consider possible declines
    - Keep it simple – stick to standard data
  - Projected job openings versus annual job openings
    - Keep the projected openings
    - Value in using postings
    - Can look at wage data
      - Wage potential? Seems to come from movement to different but related occupations
      - Trades tend to stay in same occupation
      - Wage earning potential pathways
      - Apprenticeships – % to scale differences

**BRAD LITTLE**  
GOVERNOR

**Wendi Secrist**  
*Executive Director*



**Deni Hoehne**  
*Chair*

**John Young**  
*Vice Chair*

## **WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL**

514 W Jefferson St, Ste 131, Boise, ID 83702

- Can we tie to the Career Pathway Plan
- Our job is to get them into a career pathway
- We must determine what are the in-demand careers
- Location Quotient – compares concentration of industry
- Postings left up and counted as new every 60 days
- Number of posting versus how long they were posted
- Difficulty to fill

### **Lunch (12 – 12:30)**

#### Re-format of In demand

- Average annual openings through IDOL
- Wage protentional
- Burning Glass credentials eval/ wage for pathways
- Location Quotient for state
  - Could drill down to region
  - Look at it with and without
  - Must understand the definition of “regional concentration”
    - How much does it matter?
  - Economic specialization in location
  - Idaho Advantage
- Ranking Data
  - Lower score = higher rank
  - Implementation:
    - Must consider 3<sup>rd</sup> quintile
      - Un-quintile or rank within or go to financial need
      - Financial need may not be viable
    - Clear decision process
  - Must match BLS and take out all master or above or does not require training will be removed

### **Debrief on Burning Glass Project Discussion (12:30 – 1:30)**

**All**

- Projected annual openings (IDOL and Lightcast)
- Wages by percentile = entry level, 25<sup>th</sup> percentile, median wage, 75<sup>th</sup> percentile (IDOL)
- Wages potential = percent difference between 75<sup>th</sup> percentile and entry level wages for each occupation (IDOL)
- Location Quotient (Lightcast)
- Difficulty to fill = posting days (Lightcast)
- Anticipated growth = both 10 year and annual (IDOL)

**BRAD LITTLE**  
GOVERNOR

**Wendi Secrist**  
*Executive Director*



**Deni Hoehne**  
*Chair*

**John Young**  
*Vice Chair*

## **WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL**

514 W Jefferson St, Ste 131, Boise, ID 83702

- Churn (Lightcast and IDOL)
- Living wage (MIT living wage)

### **\*Adult LAUNCH Priorities (1:30 – 3:30)**

### **Hope Morrow**

- Adult LAUNCH Priorities
  - Great Misalignment Article
    - Middle-skills exist between a high school diploma and a 4-year degree
    - Pressure on middle-skills providers to meet local workforce needs is growing
    - 31% of projected job openings will go to middle-skills workers each year
  - The Risk
    - Only 21% of students who intend to transfer to a 4-year university do so
    - The rest of these students are middle-skills employees with potentially misaligned credentials
  - Action on multiple fronts
    - Focus on alignment across institutions
    - Improve data practices to continually inform efforts to align credential production with labor-market needs
    - Invest in counseling and programmatic efforts that maximize students' use of data
    - Improve career preparation and transfer pathways to bachelor's degree programs in fields with no direct occupational match.
  - 428 available at \$3500

**Motion made by Mr. Puga regarding the Adult Launch program defining the application windows: August 2024 - \$1.5M, for obligation, January/ mid-December – remainder of funds + recapture, window will remain open until all money is obligated. Distribution will be per the industry list. Approximately ~ 428 grants to be distributed as follows: Healthcare (20%) ~85 people ++, Transportation (20%) ~85 people, Construction/ Utilities (20%) ~85 people, Technology (15%) ~64 people++, Education (5%) ~21 people Goods Producing (20%) ~85 people++. Goods producing to include Natural Resources, Mining, Manufacturing, and Agriculture. Second by Mr. Smith. Motion carried**

### **Wrap Up (3:30 – 4:00)**

**A unanimous consent motion by Ms. Barber. Second by Ms. Revier. No objections.**

**Adjourned at 2:46 p.m.**